

---

**Fwd: Questions from Cortes Currents**

---

**Roy L Hales** <roy.hales9@gmail.com>  
To: De Clarke <taz.in.bc@gmail.com>

Mon, Nov 28, 2022 at 2:25 PM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Michelle Franze** <michelle@bcsalmonfarmers.ca>

Date: Thu, Nov 24, 2022 at 11:16 AM

Subject: Re: Questions from Cortes Currents

To: Roy L Hales <roy.hales9@gmail.com>

Cc: Brian Kingzett <brian@bcsalmonfarmers.ca>, Ruth Salmon <ruth@bcsalmonfarmers.ca>

Hi Roy,

My apologies, for the delay. We have not had time to have fish health professionals review the paper, but we can provide you with a few immediate observations from Brian Kingzett, our Director of Science and Policy:

1. The authors sampled biological material around salmon farms for an endemic virus we would expect to find everywhere in the ocean and then fail to mention that they had no control sampling locations to compare.
2. By citing their own papers largely they are claiming proof that PRV-1a found in BC is a pathogen when it has not been shown in any experimental studies to have a negative effects on wild or farmed salmon. The authors of the paper are not vets or epidemiologists. This research group repeats this fallacy over and over until it is taken as fact.
3. Samples from processing plants was done long before new treatment systems were installed to meet public concerns. The authors did not contact plants to see whether they were processing wild or farm fish and made assumptions.
4. Smolts leaving hatcheries are screened for PRV and PRV is not detected in the salmon before they are stocked into the ocean pens – but the authors make unfounded conclusions that PRV is coming from hatcheries.
5. The work on whether the virus is mutating is new and poorly supported – but the authors jump to giant conclusions that this is the result of aquaculture.
6. Additionally, what the paper concludes and the claims that Morton is making on her social media about the paper do not line up.

Additionally, attached you will find a document focused on PRV and correcting common misconceptions, which you are also welcome to reference and quote.

Thanks,

**Michelle Franze**

Manager of Communications, Partnerships and Community

Co-Founder and Co-Director of the Young Salmon Farmers of BC (YSFBC)

Mobile: +1-604-202-4417

Email: [michelle@bcsalmonfarmers.ca](mailto:michelle@bcsalmonfarmers.ca)



BC Salmon Farmers Association

201-911 Island Highway, Campbell River, BC, V9W 2C2

[bcsalmonfarmers.ca](http://bcsalmonfarmers.ca) [YSFBC](#) [LinkedIn](#) [Instagram](#) [Facebook](#) [Twitter](#) [YouTube](#)

---

**From:** Roy L Hales <[roy.hales9@gmail.com](mailto:roy.hales9@gmail.com)>  
**Date:** Wednesday, November 23, 2022 at 9:26 AM  
**To:** Michelle Franze <[michelle@bcsalmonfarmers.ca](mailto:michelle@bcsalmonfarmers.ca)>  
**Subject:** Questions from Cortes Currents

Hi Michelle:

In regard to the paper 'Detection and phylogenetic assessment of PRV-1 via sampling of biological materials released from salmon farms in British Columbia' published by the Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences on 18 Nov, 2022 <https://doi.org/10.1139/cjfas-2022-0019>

1. Does the BC Salmon Farmers Association have any response to the statement that PRV-1 was found on 70% of the samples they took from 56 farms?
2. Does the BC Salmon Farmers Association have any response to the suggestion that 'marine mortality from pathogens ... omnipresent in farm salmon in BC and present in wild Pacific salmon at varying levels' are a leading contributor to the decline of wild salmon stocks since 1990?

My deadline in this case is the late afternoon of Thursday, Nov 24.

Roy

Cortes Currents

250-935-6328

---

 **PRV response for deeper dive.docx**  
35K